



OFFICE of the ATTORNEY GENERAL
GREG ABBOTT

January 17, 2003

Mr. James M. Frazier III
Assistant General Counsel
Texas Department of Criminal Justice
Office of the General Counsel
P.O. Box 4004
Huntsville, Texas 77342-4004

OR2003-0366

Dear Mr. Frazier:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 175148.

The Texas Department of Criminal Justice (the "department") received a request for "all applications, selection documentation, and interview documentation pertinent to Job #970000." You indicate that you will provide some information to the requestor. You claim, however, that certain information is excepted from disclosure pursuant to section 552.117 and that the questions and answers relating to this job posting are excepted from disclosure under section 552.122 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.117(3) excepts from public disclosure the home addresses, home telephone numbers, social security numbers, and family member information of employees of the department, regardless of whether the employees complied with section 552.1175. However, this subsection does not apply to former department employees. The submitted information contains the social security numbers of individuals other than the requestor. If these individuals were department employees at the time this request was received, their social security numbers must be withheld pursuant to section 552.117(3).

If these individuals were not department employees at the time of the request, section 552.117(1) may apply. This subsection protects the personal information of both "current and former" officials or employees who elect under section 552.024 to keep such information confidential. Whether a particular piece of information is protected by section 552.117 must

be determined at the time the request for it is made. *See* Open Records Decision No. 530 at 5 (1989). Therefore, if these individuals were previously employed by the department and, prior to the receipt of this request, they elected to keep their social security numbers confidential, the department must withhold the social security numbers that we have marked.

If section 552.117 does not apply to these social security numbers, they may nevertheless be confidential under federal law and therefore excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code.¹ The 1990 amendments to the federal Social Security Act, 42 U.S.C. § 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I), make confidential social security numbers and related records that are obtained or maintained by a state agency or political subdivision of the state pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990. *See* Open Records Decision No. 622 (1994). We have no basis for concluding that any of the social security numbers in the file are confidential under section 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I), and therefore excepted from public disclosure under section 552.101 on the basis of that federal provision. We caution, however, that section 552.352 of the Public Information Act imposes criminal penalties for the release of confidential information. Prior to releasing any social security number information, you should ensure that no such information was obtained or is maintained by the department pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990.

We now address your arguments regarding the interview questions. Section 552.122 of the Government Code excepts from required public disclosure "a test item developed by a . . . governmental body[.]" Gov't Code § 552.122(b). In Open Records Decision No. 626 (1994), this office determined that the term "test item" in section 552.122 includes "any standard means by which an individual's or group's knowledge or ability in a particular area is evaluated," but does not encompass evaluations of an employee's overall job performance or suitability. *Id.* at 6. The question of whether specific information falls within the scope of section 552.122(b) must be determined on a case-by-case basis. *Id.* Traditionally, this office has applied section 552.122 where release of "test items" might compromise the effectiveness of future examinations. *Id.* at 4-5; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 118 (1976). Section 552.122 also protects the answers to test questions when the answers might reveal the questions themselves. *See* Attorney General Opinion JM-640 at 3 (1987); Open Records Decision No. 626 at 8 (1994).

Having reviewed the questions at issue, we agree that questions 1, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, and 9 evaluate an individual's or group's knowledge or ability in a particular area. Furthermore, the answers to these questions might reveal the questions themselves. Therefore the department may withhold questions 1, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, and 9 as well as the corresponding preferred and actual answers pursuant to section 552.122 of the Government Code.

¹Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision" and encompasses information protected by other statutes.

In summary, we have marked social security numbers that the department must withhold if section 552.117 applies. If this section does not apply, the social security numbers must be released unless obtained or maintained pursuant to a law enacted on or after October 1, 1990. Pursuant to section 552.122, the department may withhold questions 1, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, and 9 as well as the corresponding actual and preferred answers. The remaining submitted information must be released.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at 877/673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Department of Public Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

²We note that the submitted information also includes the requestor's social security number. As the laws protecting this type of information are designed to protect an individual's privacy interest, the requestor has a special right of access to her own information. See Gov't Code § 552.023.

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at 512/475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Denis C. McElroy
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

DCM/lmt

Ref: ID# 175148

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Norma French
1919 S. Columbia Drive
West Columbia, Texas 77486
(w/o enclosures)